

## AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE INDIAN RING IN SOUTH DAKOTA

by  
George H. Phillips

### Books

- COHEN, FELIX S. *Handbook of Federal Indian Law*. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1942. Reprint. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1971. An excellent volume of the history of Indian affairs. The first volume printed in 1942 is out-of-print.
- CROOK, GEORGE. *General George Crook: His Autobiography*. Edited by Martin F. Schmitt. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1946. An interesting personal history, well footnoted by the editor. Not of great value in the study of the Indian agencies in the Dakotas.
- DEBO, ANGIE. *A History of the Indians of the United States*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1970. Interesting for a general overview of the attitudes of the various groups toward the Indians and of the treatment of Indians in general. It does not discuss the fraud cases to any extent.
- HACKER, LOUIS, AND KENDRICK, BENJAMIN B. *The United States Since 1865*. New York: Crofts, 1932. This work has a good general statement about the Indian frauds on pages 136-38.
- HOWE, M.A. DEWOLF. *The Life and Labors of Bishop Hare: Apostle to the Sioux*. New York: Sturgis & Walton Co., 1911. This biography deliberately slights the episode between Bishop W.H. Hare and the Reverend S.D. Hinman. It is, however, one of the few sources of information on the subject.
- HYDE, GEORGE E. *A Sioux Chronicle*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1956. An Omaha man, once a research assistant to George B. Grinnel, Hyde gives a good account of the Indian problems during this period. He does not go

370      *South Dakota History*

into the details of any fraud cases, but he mentions them and has some very decided opinions about some of the personalities involved. The book contains a few errors, such as referring to Professor Painter of the Indian Rights Association as Professor Pointer and spelling William Welsh's name Welch. Hyde blames most of the fraud scandals on the Eastern religious groups and the philanthropists, or "The Brethern," as he calls them.

KINGSBURY, GEORGE W. *History of Dakota Territory*. 5 vols. Chicago, Ill.: S.J. Clarke Publishing Co., 1915. This work consists of five volumes and is undoubtedly one of the best single sources of information on Dakota Territory, despite the fact that it is poorly documented and highly subjective. Because Kingsbury was an early editor in Dakota Territory, his work might well be classified as primary material.

LAMAR, HOWARD R. *Dakota Territory, 1861-1889*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1956. About six pages of this book deal with the Indian ring cases and much of the information was drawn from newspapers of the general area at the time. Lamar also relies heavily on Kingsbury, although he seems to doubt Kingsbury's version of the H.F. Livingston trials.

MANYPENNY, GEORGE W. *Our Indian Wards*. Cincinnati, Ohio: Robert Clarke & Co., 1880. The introduction tells of the persecution of the Indians by the War Department. Good for background material, but it seems prejudiced against the military.

MARDOCK, ROBERT W. *The Reformers and the American Indian*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1971. Mardock's discussion centers on the development of the federal Indian policy from the Civil War through the Dawes Act, emphasizing the role played by the reformers and the humanitarians. A necessary work for achieving a balanced outlook concerning the accomplishments of the reformers and the problems of establishing an equitable federal Indian policy.

MCGILLYCUDDY, JULIA B. *McGillycuddy Agent: A Biography of Dr. Valentine T. McGillycuddy*. Palo Alto, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1941. Written by the second wife of Dr. Valentine T. McGillycuddy, the

*The Indian Ring* 371

controversial agent at Pine Ridge, this book is too highly prejudiced to be of much value. The author obtained most of the information from McGillicuddy in his declining years, but the version is highly colored by the obvious high esteem his wife held for him.

MCKENNEY, THOMAS L. *Memoirs*. New York: Paine & Burgess, 1846. A former Indian commissioner mentions some of the frauds and related problems during the Jackson administration. Chapters nine, ten, and eleven are especially pertinent.

MCLAUGHLIN, JAMES. *My Friend the Indian*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1910. New edition, Seattle, Wa.: Superior Publishing Co., 1970. James McLaughlin was an Indian agent in the Dakotas for thirty years, longer than any other man. He is one of the few agents who was never seriously charged with fraud. His book is important for the general picture of Indian affairs, especially from the standpoint of the Indian agent.

OTIS, ELWELL S. *The Indian Question*. New York: Sheldon & Co., 1878. On page 197 this military officer discusses the old policy of "kill and tame," and on page 212 he discusses in a general way the Indian ring and the reputation of the Indian agents. Like many military men of that period, he had little use for civilian agents.

PAXSON, FREDERICK L. *History of the American Frontier*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1924. Good for the background of the earlier Indian frauds.

PAXSON, FREDERICK L. *Last American Frontier*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1910. Valuable general history with considerable mention of the Indian problems, including the frauds in the Indian Bureau. Chapters two, eight, fourteen through eighteen, and twenty-one are pertinent.

PRIEST, LORING B. *Uncle Sam's Stepchildren: The Reformation of United States Indian Policy, 1865-1877*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1942. Contains scattered mention of the Indian frauds and of the persons involved. Extensive bibliography cited—including material from the National Archives.

RICHARDSON, JAMES D., ed. *A Compilation of the Messages and Papers of the Presidents, 1789-1897*. 10 vols.

372      *South Dakota History*

Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1896-1899. A very useful collection of the messages and papers of the presidents, arranged chronologically.

SCHELL, HERBERT S. *History of South Dakota*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1968. Necessary background material on the settlement of Dakota Territory and the Indian agencies and the agents. Useful bibliography.

SCHMECKEBIER, LAURENCE F. *The Office of Indian Affairs: Its History, Activities, and Organization*. Baltimore, Md.: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1927. An extremely valuable work, well documented, and with a very complete bibliography. No specific information about the Indian fraud cases is presented, but it points the way to investigation.

SEYMOUR, FLORA W. *Indian Agents of the Old Frontier*. New York: D. Appleton-Century Co., 1941. A worthwhile source for general information and some helpful specific points on a few of the agents. The author was selective in discussing the agents, however.

STANDING BEAR. *My People the Sioux*. Edited by E.A. Brininstool. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1928. Standing Bear was educated at Carlisle and he tells the story of the Sioux Indians as he knew it. Chapter three mentions rations issued to the Indians, and page 209 refers to Agent Spencer in derogatory terms.

TATUM, LAWRIE. *Our Red Brothers and the Peace Policy of President Ulysses S. Grant*. Philadelphia: John C. Winston & Co., 1899. New edition, Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1970. Useful background material on the federal Indian policy.

TEXTOR, LUCY E. *Official Relations Between the United States and the Sioux Indians*. Palo Alto, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1896. This volume contains general references to the shoddy treatment of the Indians but nothing directly on the frauds. It is valuable for information on treaties and agreements, however.

WHIPPLE, HENRY B. *Lights and Shadows of a Long Episcopate: Being Reminiscences and Recollections of the Right Reverend Henry Benjamin Whipple*. New York:

Macmillan Co., 1902. Interesting comments on the character of the Indian agents and the practices of the contractors and the government officials.

### Documents

- U.S. BOARD OF INDIAN COMMISSIONERS. *Annual Reports of the Board of Indian Commissioners*. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1869-90. This independent board created by an executive order 3 June 1869 gave attention to many of the more important questions of Indian policy, and because it was independent of the Office of Indian Affairs, it presented new points of view and valuable insights into the management of Indian affairs.
- U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Report on Indian Affairs in Dakota Territory*. H. Exec. Doc. 147, 39th Cong., 1st sess., 1866 (Serial 1267). This is the report of a special investigator sent to Dakota. It is devoted largely to the affairs at the Yankton Agency, where Dr. Walter A. Burleigh was the agent. It is one of the few reports that presented evidence against Burleigh.
- U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Report of the Indian Peace Commissioners*. H. Exec. Doc. 97, 40th Cong., 2nd sess., 1868 (Serial 1337). Although this report gives little specific information about frauds, it presents testimony from several authorities dealing with frauds in general and is excellent background information.
- U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Affairs in the Indian Department*. H. Rept. 39, 41st Cong., 3rd sess., 1871 (Serial 1464). William Welsh's charges against Commissioner Ely S. Parker and Parker's defense, together with testimony from many witnesses for both sides, are presented in this report. This is the main source for information on this case.
- U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Dwight J. McCann*. H. Rept. 417, 43rd Cong., 1st sess., 1874 (Serial 1624). McCann's request for damages arising from the alleged Indian raids on his beef herds comprises this report. This report is of value because it shows that he actually made such a claim and that the claim was substantiated by all of the officials who would be required to pass on it before placing it in the hands of Congress.

374      *South Dakota History*

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Evidence Taken Before the Committee on Indian Affairs*. H. Rept. 778, 43rd Cong., 1st sess., 1874 (Serial 1627). The testimony given before this committee is difficult to assess. Some of the evidence against the contractors and the suppliers appears to be very damaging; however, in the final summary, the committee virtually exonerated all of them.

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Testimony Taken Before the Committee on Indian Affairs*. H. Misc. Doc. 167, 44th Cong., 1st sess., 1875 (Serial 1702). Valuable information but conflicting testimony.

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Expenditures for Fulfilling the Treaty With the Sioux Indians*. H. Misc. Doc. 126, 44th Cong., 1st sess., 1876 (Serial 1702). Information on the rations and the annuity goods for the Sioux.

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Transfer of the Indian Bureau to the War Department*. H. Rept. 240, 44th Cong., 1st sess., 1876 (Serial 1708). Useful background material.

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Transfer of the Indian Bureau to the War Department*. H. Rept. 241, 45th Cong., 2nd sess., 1878 (Serial 1822). Useful for background material. The prefatory statement quotes some earlier reports and is valuable.

U.S. CONGRESS. SENATE. *Testimony Taken by a Joint Committee Considering the Expediency of the Transfer of the Indian Bureau to the War Department*. S. Misc. Doc. 53, 45th Cong., 3rd sess., 1879 (Serial 1835). Useful background material; this 406 page report brings out various general charges dealing with alleged fraud and inefficiency in the Indian Bureau.

U.S. CONGRESS. SENATE. *Transfer of the Indian Bureau to the War Department*. S. Rept. 693, 45th Cong., 3rd sess., 1879 (Serial 1837). Valuable for the background causes of alleged fraud.

U.S. CONGRESS. HOUSE. *Report of the Public Lands Commission*. H. Exec. Doc. 46, 46th Cong., 2nd sess., 1879 (Serial 1923). Of limited value except for occasional testimonies from the western ranchers and miners who favored taking land from the Indians.

U.S. CONGRESS. SENATE. *Investigation of the Removal of*

*the Ponca Indians*. S. Rept. 670, 46th Cong., 2nd sess., 1880 (Serial 1898). One of two official reports of the investigations of the Ponca removal. This report is a necessary work for understanding the persons involved.

U.S. CONGRESS. SENATE. *Report of the Committee to Ascertain Facts in Regard to the Removal of the Ponca Indians*. S. Exec. Doc. 30, 46th Cong., 3rd sess., 1881 (Serial 1941). Valuable for the statements and letters from Inspector Edward C. Kemble, as well as his opponents.

U.S. CONGRESS. SENATE. *Investigation of the Sioux Land-buying Commission*. S. Rept. 283, 48th Cong., 1st sess., 1884 (Serial 2174). Senator Dawes headed a committee that investigated the work of a commission that had been sent to the Sioux to try to buy large portions of their reservations. Many people said the commission, headed by former Dakota Territorial Governor Newton D. Edmunds, obtained Indian signatures through pressure, threats, and deceit. In the process of investigating the Dawes Committee took a great deal of testimony from Indians on all of the Dakota reservations. Many charges of cheating were made by the Indians, but there were no specific charges of fraud that would stand without further investigation. This is a valuable report for understanding the attitudes of the Indians and the methods of investigating committees.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR. OFFICE OF INDIAN AFFAIRS. *Annual Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs to the Secretary of the Interior*. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1870-90. These reports contain a statement of the conditions and the recommendations of the commissioner followed by reports of the agencies by the Indian agents and special investigating boards. Unfortunately, they do not contain all of the reports of the investigations and they almost never refer to specific frauds. They are useful for the viewpoints of the agents and for the statistical information compiled about the various tribes.

### Newspapers and Periodicals

*Army and Navy Journal*. 1870-1890. Though privately published, this weekly journal expressed a military viewpoint on Indian affairs. The volumes from 1870 through 1890 are valuable; however, the articles are highly prejudiced.

376 *South Dakota History*

CLARK, STANLEY. "Ponca Publicity." *Mississippi Valley Historical Review* 29(Mar. 1943):495. Very good for the story of the Ponca removals.

DOUGHERTY, WILLIAM E. "Army Officer's View of the Indian Question." *Harpers* 36(23 July 1892):706. A scholarly discussion by an army officer who spent several years as an Indian agent. Interesting only because he took over H.F. Livingston's agency in 1879.

LEUPP, FRANCIS E. "Spoilsmen and the Indian Agencies." *Nation* 65(28 Oct. 1897):333. A good discussion that claims that politicians and cattlemen have corrupted the Office of Indian Affairs and that neither the Indians nor the government can do much about the situation because most of the politicians from the Dakotas and other Western states are either cattlemen or attorneys for cattlemen.

MILES, NELSON. "The Indian Problem." *North American Review* 128(Mar. 1879):304. A general view of the Indian question as seen by the typical military man who had spent many years in the West among the Sioux. Useful for study of the military viewpoint of Indian affairs.

NEIL, WILLIAM M. "The Territorial Governor as Indian Superintendent in the Trans-Mississippi West." *Mississippi Valley Historical Review* 43(Sept. 1956):213. An excellent, scholarly study of the subject, well documented.

*New York Tribune*. Apr.-Nov. 1875. News reports and editorials on the Red Cloud Agency frauds and the eventual resignation of Secretary of the Interior Columbus Delano.

*Sioux City Daily Journal*. 1870-90. Of considerable value to a study of the H.F. Livingston cases.

*Yankton Daily Press and Dakotian*. 1870-90. Valuable primary source.

YOUNG, MARY E. "The Creek Frauds." *Mississippi Valley Historical Review* 42(Dec. 1955):411. An excellent report on the frauds of the Alabama Indians.



Copyright of South Dakota History is the property of South Dakota State Historical Society and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.

All illustrations in this issue are the property of the South Dakota State Historical Society except those on the following pages: p. 357 from the National Archives; p. 361 from the State Historical Society of North Dakota; pp. 378–79 from Donald Porter; and p. 384 from the State Historical Society of Wisconsin.