A Triad of Alliances: The Roots of Holy Rosary Indian Mission

Robert W. Galler, Jr.

Each day of the academic year, Oglala Lakota middle-school students raise three flags in front of Red Cloud Indian School: the American flag, the South Dakota flag, and the flag of the Lakota people. Unnoticed by most passersby, this daily occurrence four and one-half miles north of Pine Ridge, South Dakota, is historically significant, reflecting the interaction of groups whose paths have more often diverged than melded. Constructed in 1887 and 1888 as Holy Rosary Mission, the institution was partially supported by the United States government, supervised by Roman Catholic missionaries, and utilized by Red Cloud’s Oglala people. Despite the numerous challenges facing cross-cultural institutions, the mission school continues to educate students of the Pine Ridge Indian Reservation. In its endurance and adaptability to changing times, the school stands as testament to an historic process of tripartite leadership and motivations.

1. Placidus Siam, S. J., “The History of Holy Rosary Mission: Pine Ridge South Dakota, 1888-1932,” 1932, pp. 4-5, Holy Rosary Mission Archives, Pine Ridge, S.Dak. The Oglalas and their Brulé, Minneconjou, Hunkpapa, Sans Arc, Two Kettle, and Blackfoot relations comprise the seven bands of the Lakota (western) division of the Sioux federation. This confederacy also includes the Yanktonai and Yankton of the Nakota (middle) and the Mdewakanton, Wahpekute, Sisseton, and Wahpeton of the Dakota (eastern) division. Since its founding, the institution known today as Red Cloud Indian School has been known variously as Drexel Mission, Holy Rosary Mission, and Pine Ridge Educational Society, Inc.

While the federal government had established various boarding schools throughout the West by the late 1880s, the founding of Holy Rosary proved unique due to the complexity of interaction between the three interest groups, each with its own agenda. Federal officials sought an additional boarding school on the Pine Ridge reservation to augment their assimilation efforts at the government-run Pine Ridge Boarding School. Jesuit missionaries, serving at the request of Martin Marty, bishop for Dakota Territory, hoped to cultivate the Catholic faith in western Dakota. Red Cloud and his Oglala kinsmen looked for instruction in the English language and American societal norms, while maintaining Lakota traditions, in order to operate more effectively in a rapidly changing cultural environment. The politically savvy Red Cloud also sought Jesuit allies in his relations with federal officials (normally Protestants), of whom he had grown increasingly suspicious.

Representatives from each of these three groups served as cultural brokers who mediated among societal systems of distinct philosophies and rituals. Through trial and error, obstinacy and compromise, they found common rationale to support the endeavor. In 1887, Jesuit brother Henry Billing directed Oglala workers to form bricks from clay mined at the mission site and lay the school’s foundation.


4. Detailed examinations of the leadership of Red Cloud and the Oglala Lakotas during the early reservation period are found in James C. Olson, Red Cloud and the Sioux Problem (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1965); George E. Hyde, Red Cloud’s Folk: A History of the Oglala Sioux Indians (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1937); and Julia B. McGillycuddy, McGillycuddy, Agent: A Biography of Dr. Valentine T. McGillycuddy (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1941).

on a 160-acre plot that a man named Cow Killer had relinquished to the federal government for educational use.6

Quite probably, few of the participants in this endeavor were familiar with the historical background for their actions. The role of the federal government in Indian education evolved from Article I, Section 8 of the Constitution of the United States, which delegated to Congress the power "to regulate commerce with foreign nations, and among the several States, and with the Indian tribes." This document placed in the hands of congressmen ultimate authority over federal Indian policies, a responsibility that grew larger and more complex as increasing numbers of immigrants occupied more western land. Even as the first colonists encroached on native lands, lively debate ensued over whether Indians were "noble savages," i.e., people who lived in an uncorrupted,
idyllic state, or "ignoble savages," cruel heathens with a penchant for war, a tendency toward cannibalism, and an ineducable intellect.7

A colonial and early American policy of segregating Indians and whites proved increasingly impractical as immigration burgeoned after the War of 1812, forcing federal officials to look for long-range solutions to the "Indian problem." At the same time, Christian evangelists and Enlightenment rationalists agreed that, while Indian people lived in a less-advanced state than non-Indians, they had the ability to embrace "civilization." Thomas Jefferson ethnocentrically suggested that American Indians, as rational people, would eventually embrace American traditions. Within a political framework of the Enlightenment and a moral construct of the Second Great Awakening, intellectuals and ecclesiastics worked together to promote the Indians' assimilation.8

Holy Rosary Mission and other western Indian schools trace their origins back to these eastern philosophical and political traditions. In 1819, Congress initiated a program of American Indian assimilation when it passed a measure appropriating ten thousand dollars to be distributed annually at the discretion of the president for "the civilization of the Indian tribes adjoining the frontier settlement." As the first president with access to these funds, James Monroe ordered them channeled to the "benevolent societies" that had underwritten the education of Indian children in prior years.9 Monroe's benevolent societies consisted mostly of Protestant organiza-

8. Ibid., 1:138, 141. Faith in the power of human reason and innovations in political, religious, and educational doctrine characterized the Enlightenment, a philosophical movement of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The Second Great Awakening was one of several Protestant religious revivals that took place in America in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.
tions inasmuch as most Americans of the period claimed a Protestant affiliation. Groups such as the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (founded by Presbyterians and Congregationalists in 1810) and the American Home Mission Society (established by various Protestant groups in 1826) had global evangelistic objectives yet also emphasized work among Indian tribes. Catholics in the United States would have no formal Indian mission organization until several decades later. The country’s first Roman Catholic diocese, established in 1789 at Baltimore with over twenty-five thousand members, was still a fledgling organization that mainly served the growing immigrant population in the East. By default, diocesan leaders left the work of spreading the Catholic faith among Indians to the religious orders.

One Catholic religious order, the Society of Jesus (Jesuits), had prior experience in North America. French Jesuits had appeared in Quebec in 1632, and soon thereafter the “Black Robes” had pressed out among the tribes of New France. European Jesuits had accompanied Spanish explorers, starting missions in present-day southern California as early as 1697. With the spread of Protestantism and the Enlightenment came a backlash against these ardent Catholic evangelists, who wielded considerable power in secular affairs. At the same time, adversaries existed among the church hierarchy in Rome, and the Pope suppressed the Jesuit order worldwide in 1773.

Most Jesuits, such as John Carroll, who became the first Catholic bishop of Baltimore (United States), either joined other orders or became diocesan priests. Gradually, howev-

er, old enmities diminished, and in 1814, the Pope reinstated the Jesuit order after forty-one years of suppression. At the same time, many European Catholics seeking greater religious and economic liberty crossed the Atlantic to the United States, followed by Jesuit priests who recognized a fertile mission field.

In 1823, Secretary of War John C. Calhoun invited Jesuits from Maryland to establish a novitiate at Florissant, Missouri, to assist his overburdened department with promoting Indian acculturation. After establishing schools for Indian children, the Jesuits opened a center for missions at Saint Louis in 1829. Jesuit influence so increased over the following years that church officials designated the order to lead the Catholic mission system in the American West, beginning in 1834.\(^{12}\)

A young Belgian Jesuit named Pierre Jean De Smet led the pioneering efforts at Florissant and Saint Louis and quickly

became influential as a missionary. Beginning in 1838 with work among the Potawatomis near Council Bluffs in present-day Iowa, De Smet embarked on an odyssey covering thousands of miles and involving many western tribes. He first met the Sioux the following year near the mouth of the Vermillion River. His physical stamina, courage, and compassion won him the respect of many Indian people, including a Blackfoot Sioux leader who laid down his arms when De Smet was identified as "the man who talks to the Great Spirit." Federal officials later requested his assistance on diplomatic missions among the Indians because of his good relations with many tribes.

While Protestants also sent missionaries into the unknown West, many Indians responded most favorably to Catholic brothers and priests, whose mystical and ritualistic practices proved similar to their own. The Indians also admired the Jesuit commitment to the Great Spirit. "The Black-robe has neither wife nor children. His heart is undivided," stated Yankton Sioux leader Struck-by-the-ree. "All his care is for God and the happiness of the people that surround his cabin and the house of prayer." As a result, Jesuits were often preferred over their Protestant counterparts, particularly in the Pacific Northwest and Northern Great Plains. The Flathead Indians of present-day Montana and Idaho, for instance, specifically requested a Black Robe after Methodist and Presbyterian ministers had offered their services. Consistent with Jesuit tradition, the missionary priests adopted some native customs and adapted their Christian messages to indigenous cultures.

15. Quoted ibid., 4:1285.
Although they remained critical of native practices like polygamy and the sun dance, the Jesuits sympathized with the Indians, whose lifestyles were undergoing drastic change. “One cannot help being anxious for the fate of the Indians on account of the approach of the whites,” De Smet wrote in the early 1860s. “The treasures concealed in the heart of the mountains will attract thousands of miners from every land; and with them will come the dregs of civilization, gamblers, drunkards, robbers and assassins.” Black Robes worked to soften the transition of Indian people into American society, often becoming their staunch allies. De Smet, for example, had initially supported government policy but grew critical of federal actions after massacres like the one that followed the 1854 Grattan affair, which suggested to the missionary that the United States promoted a “system of extermination.”

Recognizing the potential economic, political, and spiritual benefits of a Jesuit alliance, Sioux leaders also called for Jesuits to establish missions among their people. Two Bears, a Yanktonai leader, asserted, “When we are settled down sowing grain, raising cattle and living in houses, we want Father De Smet to come and live with us, and to bring us other Black-robes to live among us also; we will listen to their words, and the Great Spirit will love us and bless us.” In 1866, several Yankton chiefs, including Struck-by-the-Ree, implored De Smet to join them at Greenwood in Dakota Territory to instruct their children in American ways and the Catholic faith. “There is another religious [teacher] that wants to come and remain with us,” the men wrote through an interpreter. “He wants to teach us the Santee language, but

18. Ibid., 4:1219. In 1854, a military party under Lieutenant John Grattan attacked and killed several members of a Brulé Sioux band for allegedly slaying an emigrant’s cow. The Brulé reacted by killing every man in Grattan’s column. In retaliation, soldiers under General William S. Harney pursued the band to Ash Hollow in present-day Nebraska, where they attacked the Indians’ encampment, killing women and children.
Like other Sioux leaders, Struck-by-the-Roe respected the Black Robes' commitment to their religion and valued their aid in preparing Indians to live in American society.

we do not want them. We want no other than you and your religion."^20^

De Smet had solidified his relationship with the Lakota people in 1851, when he had baptized 1,856 tribal members.21 Recognizing the missionary's influence among the Indians, federal officials requested his assistance with peace negotiations, among the most important of which were those leading to the Fort Laramie Treaty of 1868, which established the Great Sioux Reservation. The Lakotas, in turn, understood that De Smet's sympathies lay with them, and leaders such as Red Cloud, Spotted Tail, and Sitting Bull discussed the many problems of Indian-white relations with De Smet and respected his opinions. During the 1868 treaty negotiations, one Lakota leader,

Black Moon, expressed his admiration for the Belgian Jesuit: "The Black-robe has made a long journey to come to us; his presence among us makes me very glad, and with all my heart I wish him welcome to my country. I can understand all the words that the Black-robe has just said to us; they are good and filled with truth."22

Thereafter, relations between federal officials and Jesuit missionaries deteriorated. This change arose in response to the growth of the country’s Catholic population and the increasing Catholic influence in Indian missions. Anti-Catholicism in the United States was an ongoing phenomenon that experienced a resurgence in the 1870s as Catholic immigrants from southern and central Europe arrived in ever-larger numbers, alarming the country’s Protestant majority.23 As early as 1855, De Smet had expressed unease over the anti-Catholic sentiment he encountered in his work. “In a country which prides itself on its unbounded liberality and liberty,” he wrote, “we might have hoped that the Catholic religion, if not protected, would at least have been screened from persecution.” In De Smet’s view, Protestant politicians and clergy seemed determined “to crush our holy religion throughout the land.”24

In the midst of this “religious war,” church groups of various denominations also joined with eastern liberals in registering complaints against the activities of “Indian rings,” or groups of corrupt government Indian agents who misused funds meant for indigenous people. Bishop Henry B. Whipple, who served the Protestant Episcopal church in eastern Sioux country, called the politically appointed agents “men without any fitness, . . . a disgrace to a Christian nation; whiskey sellers, barroom loungers, [and] debauchers.” Along with such poor leadership, Whipple wrote, came “all the evils of bad example, of inefficiency, and dishonesty.”25

23. Puchta, American Indian Policy, pp. 56, 306.
The Indians themselves grew increasingly restive under such treatment and incidents such as the Sand Creek Massacre (1864), in which troops under Colonel John M. Chivington killed more than one hundred unarmed Cheyenne Indians. In response to calls for Indian policy reform, President Ulysses S. Grant instituted his “Peace Policy” in 1869, placing tribal members on reservations to protect them from encroaching settlers and to aid their acculturation into American society. The new system designated specific Christian denominations to administer specific Indian agencies, in an attempt to discourage corruption and provide more humane treatment of indigenous populations. It also made federal contracts available to religious groups to operate day schools, on-reservation boarding schools, and off-reservation boarding schools, activities that had previously been largely independently supported.26

Federal officials placed few agencies under Catholic administration due to the country’s anti-Catholic stance and pressure from powerful Protestant-dominated organizations. Protestant groups gained exclusive jurisdiction to sixty-four out of seventy-two reservations. In Dakota Territory, only the Devil’s Lake/Fort Totten and Standing Rock agencies came under Catholic supervision. Protestant leaders also made up the advisory Board of Indian Commissioners, which monitored the spending of funds appropriated for Indian administration. In response to being largely ignored in Indian policy matters, Catholics created the Bureau of Catholic Indian Missions in 1879 to oversee the church’s Indian missions and their dealings with the federal government.27

In the meantime, the clash of cultures and ever-changing federal policies disrupted the Oglala Lakotas in many ways,
most notably in the four relocations of their agency. Red Cloud grew suspicious of the Great Father's "plan" for his people, who increasingly presented the Oglala leader with their own challenges. No Indian leader faced greater difficulties as he struggled to find the best way to accommodate federal policies, for he knew that compromise would jeopardize the "traditional" culture of his people and alienate him from conservative Lakotas. To help meet the challenges, Red

28. The first Red Cloud agency was located along the Platte River, thirty-two miles from Fort Laramie. Seeking to secure the valuable waterway, federal agents moved the Oglalas to the vicinity of Fort Robinson on the White River in Nebraska in 1873. In 1877, the agency was temporarily transferred to a site on the Missouri River. The Oglalas moved to their current location on White Clay Creek in the area of Pine Ridge, South Dakota, in 1878. Olson, Red Cloud, pp. 139, 158, 254, 262.

29. The terms "traditional" and "conservative" prove problematic. Individuals and communities necessarily adapt their cultural traditions within a historical context. Therefore, even "conservatives" who tend to follow "traditional" culture involve themselves in forms of adaptation.
Cloud turned to the Black Robes. This decision proved logical for the Lakota leader, whose ancestors had been in contact with French fur traders, most of whom were Catholic, and missionaries like De Smet for many years. The marriage of Red Cloud’s daughter to a member of the Richard trading family and Red Cloud’s adoption of translator Baptiste Pourier into his own family further encouraged the Oglala leader to embrace Roman Catholics as allies. At a meeting with the president in the White House on 28 September 1877, Red Cloud concluded his request for reservation schoolteachers with the statement, “Catholic priests are good and I want you to give me one of them also.”

31. Quoted in Olson, Red Cloud, p. 250.
As Red Cloud and other Lakota leaders struggled to accommodate competing forces, the legendary De Smet passed away in 1873. Three years later, the Bureau of Catholic Indian Missions sent Abbot Martin Marty of Saint Meinrad Abbey in Indiana to fill the void. Church leaders first designated Marty as vicar general (deputy to a bishop) for Dakota Territory, making him bishop for the territory in 1881. Lakotas, Nakotas, and Dakotas welcomed Marty and grew to respect him. Even Sitting Bull, suspicious of most newcomers, came to recognize the Benedictine as “our good friend—a good man and a priest.”

Upon arriving in the territory, Marty worked to extend Catholicism beyond the Standing Rock and Devil’s Lake agencies to other Indian communities. He hoped to reclaim many previously-baptized Catholics among the Oglalas and Upper Brulés at Pine Ridge and Rosebud and meet the requests of Red Cloud and Spotted Tail for Catholic priests. In 1879, Marty sent Benedictine father Meinrad McCarthy, armed with a letter of permission from Bishop O’Connor of Omaha, to establish a Catholic mission at Pine Ridge Agency. Agent Valentine T. McGillycuddy responded by dismissing McCarthy from the reservation, which had been assigned to the Episcopalians. McCarthy surreptitiously served the Oglalas for a time from a base off the reservation, across the White River at the Tibbits Ranch. In 1881, federal officials suspended the policy of assigning one missionary group per reservation after Catholic priests ushered Protestant clergy off the Devil’s Lake Indian Reservation in North Dakota. The government formally revoked the restriction two years later, thereafter allowing mis-

---

33. Ibid., p. 111.
sionaries of all denominations to establish missions among the Indians at any agency.35

The revision in federal policy benefited Catholics more than Protestants. The new freedom, however, found Bishop Marty with a lack of qualified personnel and led him to enlist any priests he could find. Fathers A. H. Frederick and Francis Craft, both of whom had come to Dakota from other dioceses, were ultimately dismissed from their assignments on the Pine Ridge and Rosebud reservations for exceeding their bounds of authority. In 1884, Father J. A. Bushman established a stable mission among the Oglalas, baptizing 143 tribal members between February and September. The growing number of Oglala catechists included members of prominent families such as the Pattons, Richards, Tapios, and Provosts. It is likely that Father Bushman baptized Red Cloud at this time.36

Marty received permission to establish mission schools in the receptive environment of Pine Ridge and Rosebud in 1884. Still, he lacked the necessary personnel and funding for immediate success. Failing to attract enough Benedictine priests or induce Indians to join the priesthood, Marty recruited volunteer priests and brothers from a German Jesuit community in Buffalo, New York. He next sought and received financial support from Katharine Drexel, heir to the Drexel-Morgan banking fortune and later founder of the Order of the Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament for Indians and Colored People.37

Jesuit father John Jutz, who arrived in Dakota in late 1885, selected a site for the new Holy Rosary Mission with assistance from Pine Ridge agent Hugh D. Gallagher. Located along

White Clay Creek, the site provided sufficient water and clay for building purposes. Bishop Marty officially accepted use rights on the tract from the United States government as well as a six thousand dollar donation for the project from Katharine Drexel. Workers began the construction of Holy Rosary Mission on 20 August 1887 under the direction of Father Jutz and Brother Henry Billing.  

The establishment of Holy Rosary Mission provided a tangible manifestation of emerging nineteenth century Indian-white relations. It reinforced the formal association between the United States government and the Lakota people previously established at Pine Ridge Agency and the Oglala Community School. The mission also introduced the influence of the Society of Jesus, whose members assisted in creating a bicultural society, blending American and Lakota cultural tra-

ditions, mentalities, and identities. Over time, the influence of the mission's various political actors—federal officials, Catholic missionaries, and Lakota tribal members—has ebbed and flowed. In general, Jesuit policies proved consistent with federal Indian policy even though the missionaries, in contrast to administrators of government-run schools, promoted evangelism, not strict erudition. Like federal boarding-school superintendents, the Jesuit administrators of Holy Rosary employed assimilation and segregation strategies in tandem, despite their seemingly contradictory goals. Ironically, the segregated environment of the mission often served to reinforce Lakota identity rather than assimilate students into American society.

Today, the Jesuit influence remains, while federal influence decreases and Lakota input grows. In the 1970s, tribal governments began administering several former Roman Catholic mission schools, including one each on the Crow Creek and Rosebud reservations. Jesuit leaders in Pine Ridge, however, continue to direct the educational program at Holy Rosary with increasing assistance from Lakota school board members. The fact that mission administrators and community members changed the institution's name to Red Cloud Indian School in the early 1970s reflects the growth in Lakota influence. Still, its federal, Catholic, and Oglala dispositions remain to the present.


40. Information on the growth and decline in federal funding for Holy Rosary Mission may be found in "Correspondence, 1888-1970," Holy Rosary Mission/Red Cloud Indian School Records, Bureau of Catholic Indian Missions Collections, Marquette University Library Archives, Milwaukee, Wis., and Galler, "History of Red Cloud Indian School," pp. 44-61. The rise of Lakota influence at the mission is discussed in Galler's history, pp. 62-104. Since the early 1970s, federal involvement at Holy Rosary has diminished to include only the federal lunch program. Meanwhile, state influence through curriculum and teacher certification requirements from the South Dakota Department of Education have grown.
Copyright of South Dakota History is the property of South Dakota State Historical Society and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.

All illustrations in this issue are property of the South Dakota State Historical Society, State Archives Collection, except for those on the following pages: covers and pp. 129, 141, from South Dakota Department of Tourism; p. 125, from Neil C. Hultman, Sturgis, S.Dak.; pp. 130, 133, 134, 137, 139, from Carlton L. Bonilla, Arlington, Va.; pp. 131, 136, from Michael Bell, intro., Braves and Buffalo: Plains Indian Life in 1837, Watercolours of Alfred J. Miller, Public Archives of Canada Series No. 3 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973), reproduced with permission from the Minister of Public Works and Government Services, Canada, 1998; p. 146, from Red Cloud Indian School, Pine Ridge, S.Dak.; pp. 162, 166, 169, 171, 184, from Layne Library, Dakota Wesleyan University, Mitchell, S.Dak.; inside back cover, from Cynthia Reed, Hot Springs, S.Dak.